

## **Brazilian's integration policies and the public budget: a study of the main intersection factors within the migration governance framework**

*Políticas integratórias brasileiras e orçamento público: um estudo dos principais fatores de interseção no contexto da governança migratória*

**Sidney Guerra**<sup>1</sup>

**Luísa Chaloub**<sup>2</sup>

*Universidade Federal do Rio de Janeiro*

**Summary:** 1. Introduction. 2. Migration governance framework and context. 3. Integration Policies. 4. Relationship between the integration policies and the public Budget. 5. Conclusion. 6. Bibliography.

**Abstract:** The main focus of this paper is to analyse Brazilian's integration policies and their relationship with the public budget within the migration governance framework, making a brief study of the main intersection factors. Other than that, it also tries to understand, throughout a historical and contextual reconstruction, the main political and economic reasons that shaped the models of governance and the consequent decision to design and implement the integration policies. In this scenario, the contextualist-historical method is adopted, as it is the most suitable and reliable for understanding and better assessing the topic, in order to anticipate the epistemological issues that could arise from this work. Besides that, an interdisciplinary comparative analysis is also necessary. The approach that is not concerned with mobilizing legal theory or the cultural context of its objects is not capable of producing anything but theoretical constructions allegedly scientific and, at worst, wrong conclusions. This paper outlines an unprecedented and necessary strategy for addressing this subject in order to fill the existing literature gap in the field, both in terms of topic and methodology. Through an interdisciplinary approach, this paper intends to build valuable and applicable considerations regarding the topic.

**Keywords:** Human Rights; Refugee Law; Integration Policies; Public Budget; Migration Governance.

**Resumo:** O principal foco deste artigo é analisar as políticas de integração brasileiras e sua relação com o orçamento público no âmbito da governança migratória, fazendo um breve estudo dos principais fatores de interseção. Para além disso, procura

---

<sup>1</sup> Post-Doctorate from the Center for Social Studies (CES) - University of Coimbra; Visiting Researcher at Stetson University Law School. Post-Doctorate in Culture by the Advanced Program of Contemporary Culture - Federal University of Rio de Janeiro (PACC/UFRJ); Post-Doctorate in Law - Mackenzie Presbyterian University (SP). Doctor and Master of Laws (UGF). Doctoral student in International Relations (UCC). Full Professor at the National Law School - Federal University of Rio de Janeiro (FND/UFRJ) and at the University of Grande Rio (UNIGRANRIO).

<sup>2</sup> Master in International Law from Charles University (CUNI) - International Law in Central European Countries Program. Member of the European Law Student Association - ELSA (Prague). Researcher at LEPADIA (UFRJ) and at NEPEDI (UERJ).

também compreender, por meio de uma reconstrução histórica e contextual, as principais razões políticas e econômicas que moldaram os modelos de governança e a consequente decisão de conceber e implementar políticas de integração. Nesse cenário, adota-se o método histórico-contextual, por ser o mais adequado e confiável para a compreensão e melhor avaliação do tema, a fim de antecipar as questões epistemológicas que possam surgir deste trabalho. Além disso, também é necessária uma análise comparativa interdisciplinar. A abordagem que não se preocupa em mobilizar a teoria jurídica ou o contexto cultural de seus objetos não é capaz de produzir nada além de construções teóricas pretensamente científicas e, na pior das hipóteses, conclusões equivocadas. Este artigo esboça uma estratégia inédita e necessária para abordar esse assunto a fim de preencher a lacuna existente na literatura na área, tanto em termos de tema quanto de metodologia. Por meio de uma abordagem interdisciplinar, este artigo pretende construir considerações valiosas e aplicáveis sobre o tema.

**Palavras-chave:** Direitos humanos; Direitos dos Refugiados; Políticas de Integração; Orçamento Público; Governança Migratória.

## 1. Introduction

The migration phenomenon is not new<sup>3</sup>. Human migration may be an age-old activity present in almost every society globally, yet this is the era of heightened interest in the subject, making it one of the trending topics nowadays<sup>4</sup>. The discussions about international migration at the global level are also not recent<sup>5</sup>, and it gains even more prominence with the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development recognizing migration as a cross-cutting issue<sup>6</sup> and a powerful driver of sustainable development for migrants and their communities<sup>7</sup>.

The growing interest in migration has led to various attempts to assess and compare countries' migration policies and governance, including immigration, emigration, and integration<sup>8</sup>, to demystify the complexity and diversity of human mobility and resettlement. The exam of the shifts in scale, direction, demography, and frequency can illuminate how migration is evolving while pointing to long-term trends shaped by historical and recent events, looking for medium and long-lasting

---

<sup>3</sup> See the studies produced by GUERRA, S.; EMERIQUE, L. *Minority rights and vulnerable groups*. Ijuí: Unijuí, 2008.

<sup>4</sup> MCAULIFFE, M.; TRIANDAFYLLIDOU, A. (eds.), 2021. *World Migration Report 2022*. International Organization for Migration (IOM), Geneva, p. 14. Available at: <https://publications.iom.int/books/world-migration-report-2022>. Access in: 12/05/2022.

<sup>5</sup> UNITED NATIONS. A/RES/73/195 - *the Global Compact for Safe, Orderly and Regular Migration (GCM)* - Resolution adopted by the General Assembly on 19 December 2018, p. 1. Available at: [https://refugeesmigrants.un.org/sites/default/files/180711\\_final\\_draft\\_0.pdf](https://refugeesmigrants.un.org/sites/default/files/180711_final_draft_0.pdf). Access in: 12/05/2022

<sup>6</sup> UNITED NATIONS. IOM's Global Migration Data Analysis Centre (GMDAC). Global Migration Data Portal. *Migration Data and the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)*. Available at: <https://www.migrationdataportal.org/sdgs?node=0>. Access in 09/05/2022.

<sup>7</sup> UNITED NATIONS. A/RES/70/1 - *Transforming our world: the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development*. The central reference to migration is made in Target 10.7 to facilitate orderly, safe, regular and responsible migration and mobility of people, including through the implementation of planned and well-managed migration policies. Available at: <https://sdgs.un.org/2030agenda>. Access in: 12/05/2022.

<sup>8</sup> UNITED NATIONS. IOM's Global Migration Data Analysis Centre (GMDAC). Global Migration Data Portal. *Migration Policies and Governance*. Last updated on 29 September 2021. Available at: <https://www.migrationdataportal.org/ar/themes/migrationspolitik-und-regierungsfuehrung>. Access in 09/05/2022.

solutions, and informing effective policies, programs, and operational responses on the ground<sup>9</sup>.

Migration is not uniform across the world, but, in fact, it is shaped by geographic, economic, gender, cultural<sup>10</sup> and other factors, which results in distinct migration patterns, such as migration "corridors" developed over many years<sup>11</sup>. Besides that, the experiences of refugees are heavily mediated by race and ethnicity, and refer to the geopolitics of refuge as a Global Refugee Regime "*unwittingly falls into the trap of missing the centrality of racialization as an embedded system of oppression*"<sup>12</sup>.

This heterogeneity in the migration paths makes upholding fundamental rights and supporting migrants who are most in need an even more significant challenge. The situation is worsened by the fact that "*the term itself remains one of the most misused in today's debates and news coverage, with a large quantity of misinformation about migration and migrants*"<sup>13</sup>.

In parallel to that, it is essential to note that a critical aspect of managing migration is the "*successful integration of immigrants and their descendants, and at the same time, immigration policy can contribute to the success of integration policy*"<sup>14</sup>. Nonetheless, there is a sense that some of the core values underpinning a well-functioning of global governance system can become key resources supporting the migrants' rights protection process and their integration into the local community<sup>15</sup>, and the proper model of governance can help alleviate the burden to the public budget those policies might impose.

Thus, the main focus of this paper is to make an analysis of the integration policies and their relationship with the public budget, proposing a study of the main intersection factors within the migration governance framework. Through an interdisciplinary approach, this paper intends to build valuable and applicable considerations regarding the topic taking into account the specialized bibliography and the most relevant documents on the subject.

## 2. Migration governance framework and context

The growing salience of migration as a critical issue in governance at the international, regional, national, and sub-national levels and the increased focus on migration governance, despite the challenges of a geopolitically charged competition, made some progress in the last years towards achieving the Sustainable Development Goals<sup>16</sup>, as well as on the specific issues of migration and displacement via the two Global Compacts for migration and on refugees<sup>17</sup>.

<sup>9</sup> MCAULIFFE, M.; TRIANDAFYLLIDOU, A. (eds.), 2021, *Op. Cit.* p. 14.

<sup>10</sup> KOLDINSKÁ, K. *ILO Pioneering on Domestic Workers – Migrant Women Issues*. Hungarian Journal of Legal Studies 59, No 4, pp. 420–431 (2018) DOI: 10.1556/2052.2018.59.4.6. P. 420.

<sup>11</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 18.

<sup>12</sup> TENDAYI ACHIUME; E. *Part I International Refugee Law— Reflections on the Scholarly Field*, Ch.2 Race, Refugees, and International Law. In: Cathryn Costello, Michelle Foster, Jane McAdam. *The Oxford Handbook of International Refugee Law*. 3 June of 2021. Available in: Oxford Public International Law (<http://opil.ouplaw.com>). (c) Oxford University Press, 2022. Access in: 20 May 2022.

<sup>13</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 420.

<sup>14</sup> EUROPEAN UNION. Council of the European Union. *Press release, 2618th Council Meeting Justice and Home Affairs*. Council conclusions. Brussels, 19 November 2004. P. 15. Available at: [https://ec.europa.eu/migrant-integration/library-document/common-basic-principles-immigrant-integration-policy-eu\\_en](https://ec.europa.eu/migrant-integration/library-document/common-basic-principles-immigrant-integration-policy-eu_en). Access in: 10/05/2022

<sup>15</sup> MCAULIFFE, M.; TRIANDAFYLLIDOU, A. (eds.), 2021, *Op. Cit.* p. 22.

<sup>16</sup> UNITED NATIONS. OIM. *The Sustainable Development Goals Report 2021*. New York. Available at <https://unstats.un.org/sdgs/report/2021/The-Sustainable-Development-Goals-Report-2021.pdf>. Access in: 12/05/2022.

<sup>17</sup> UNITED NATIONS. A/RES/73/151. 17 December 2018. *Op. Cit.*

At the regional level, in South America, despite having "uneven" policy responses, has some of the most progressive and liberal migration and refugee legislation in the world<sup>18</sup>, based on the Cartagena Declaration on Refugees<sup>19</sup> signed in 1984 responded to the "*persistent economic crisis, poverty, and insecurity that had arisen in Central America, as well as the longer-term experience with forcibly displaced persons and the adoption of political asylum as a response*"<sup>20</sup>. Compared with the EU, South American countries "*on average, are more progressive regarding the scope of protection and the socio-economic integration of asylum seekers and refugees*", and it is essential to highlight that "*Argentina, Brazil, Costa Rica, Ecuador, Nicaragua, and Mexico surpass EU protection standards*"<sup>21</sup>.

A series of declarations supplemented the Cartagena Declaration as the San Jose Declaration on Refugees and Displaced Persons (1994)<sup>22</sup>, the Mexico Plan of Action (2004)<sup>23</sup>, the Brasilia Declaration on the Protection of Refugees and Stateless Persons in the Americas (2010)<sup>24</sup>, and the Brazil Declaration (2014)<sup>25</sup>. Today, more than 15 Latin American states have transposed the broad refugee definition provided in the Cartagena Declaration into their national legislation.

In this scenario, the significant contributions of NGOs and academia once again cannot be disregarded. For example, to monitor and assess the results of the migration policies was created the platform "MigraCidades: Improving Local Migration Governance in Brazil", as a result of a partnership between the Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul (UFRGS) and the International Organization for Migration (IOM), with the support of the National School of Public Administration. This platform aims to train local actors, boost migratory dialogue, certify government engagement in improving migratory governance and give visibility to good practices identified in Brazilian regions and municipalities<sup>26</sup>. Besides that, one can also highlight the crucial contributions of Caritas of the Diocese, Jesuit Service to Migrants and Refugees, and Migration and Human Rights Institute, among others.

Therefore, as could be seen by the several examples above, one cannot deny the effort of the subjects of international law to currently framing their actions in normative discourses. Nevertheless, this initiative is not always successful. Even

---

<sup>18</sup> CARRERA, S; INELI, M; LINA, C; BRUMAT, V. CEPS Policy Insights No 2022-09. *The EU Grants Temporary Protection for People Fleeing War in Ukraine. Time to rethink unequal solidarity in EU asylum policy*. 2022. Available at: <https://www.ceps.eu/ceps-publications/eu-grants-temporary-protection-for-people-fleeing-war-in-ukraine/>. Access in: 12/05/2022. P. 38.

<sup>19</sup> Colloquium on the International Protection of Refugees in Central America, Mexico and Panama. Regional Refugee Instruments & Related, *Cartagena Declaration on Refugees*. 22 November 1984. Available at: [https://www.oas.org/dil/1984\\_cartagena\\_declaration\\_on\\_refugees.pdf](https://www.oas.org/dil/1984_cartagena_declaration_on_refugees.pdf). Access in: 13/05/2022.

<sup>20</sup> CARRERA, S; INELI, M; LINA, C; BRUMAT, V. 2022. *Op. Cit.* P. 42.

<sup>21</sup> FREIER, F.L.; GAUCI, J.P. Refugee Rights Across Regions: A Comparative Overview of Legislative Good Practices in Latin America and the EU', *Refugee Survey Quarterly*, 39(3), 2020. P. 321-362. In: CARRERA, S; INELI, M; LINA, C; BRUMAT, V. *Op. Cit.* P. 54.

<sup>22</sup> Regional Refugee Instruments, San José *Declaration on Refugees and Displaced Persons*, 7 December 1994. Available at: <https://www.refworld.org/docid/4a54bc3fd.html>. Access in: 13/05/2022.

<sup>23</sup> Regional Refugee Instruments & Related, Mexico *Declaration and Plan of Action to Strengthen International Protection of Refugees in Latin America*, 16 November 2004. Available at: <https://www.unhcr.org/455443b30.pdf>. Access in: 13/05/2022.

<sup>24</sup> UNITED NATIONS. UN High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR), *Brasilia Declaration on the Protection of Refugees and Stateless Persons in the Americas*, 11 November 2010. Available at: <https://www.unhcr.org/protection/basic/4cdd3fac6/brasilia-declaration-protection-refugees-stateless-persons-americas-brasilia.html>. Access in: 13/05/2022.

<sup>25</sup> Regional Refugee Instruments & Related, *Brazil Declaration and Plan of Action*, 3 December 2014 Available at: <https://www.unhcr.org/brazil-declaration.html>. Access in: 13/05/2022.

<sup>26</sup> UFRGS. Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul. *A plataforma migracidades*. The Platform migracidades. Available at: <https://www.ufrgs.br/migracidades/>. Access in: 09/05/2022.

though all condemn war and its consequences, some wars seem to gain greater importance in policy and, therefore, a more forceful legal response.

For example, much has been said about the "selective solidarity" regarding the Ukrainian war. The EU is rightly welcoming Ukrainians. Yet, the non-entry policies toward non-European asylum seekers such as Syrians in 2015 and, more recently, in 2021, the very small number of asylum seekers at the Polish-Belarusian border<sup>27</sup> "cannot be overlooked. Despite all the good that the EU is doing at this time, this differential treatment is already attracting critical comments"<sup>28</sup>. There are some explanatory factors, such as the regional dimensions, which reflect shared geography and history and perhaps there is also some force in considering this as a crisis in Europe about Europe, as it makes Europeans feel it. One can also mention the scale and suddenness of it, which is unprecedented in post-war European history. But, in fact, the comparisons do indicate that there are other nationalistic forces to be reckoned with<sup>29</sup>. There have also been some "reports of exclusion and discrimination against non-Europeans which, in the case of the Polish authorities, have been denied"<sup>30</sup>.

Thus, many times the fulfilment of the Refugee Convention by law is challenged and relativized by political and economic realities all over the world. Generally, human rights receive contours of universality, but the framing of conduct to a human right recognized in an international document as a global compact clearly depends on certain political and economic choices quite evident. The selective efficiency of legal rules is not only directed at international law but at all rights. The difference is that, in schematics of local subordination, political and economic choices of a jurisdictional body, for example, identify themselves as sociologically justifiable choices, while those made in the international environment are framed basically and purely in power relations. The states, therefore, adhere to the protection of the human being, contribute to the construction of discourse on the universality of these rights, and, when confronted with the need to act definitively to promote the materialized in the norm, are reluctant. Political and economic needs create the right, and the same policy later resists the efficiency of the established normative body<sup>31</sup>.

In the migration governance framework today, the states also interact with other subjects. The international organizations act in a way that is often equated with the subjects *par excellence* and even manage to create international forums capable of producing - or, depending on the dynamics of applicable power, imposing - governance. Governance practices, often linked to absolutely non-state actors, can materialize through the so-called "soft law". But the relevance of the State was not overcome by the admission of other actors as subjects of law in the global normative framework, and the political and economic dynamics often imposed on sovereign

---

<sup>27</sup> Government of Poland. Poland in Nigeria. News. *Important notice: crossing Ukrainian-Polish border*. Available at: <https://www.gov.pl/web/nigeria-en/important-notice-crossing-ukrainian-polish-border>. Access in: 13/05/2022.

<sup>28</sup> FAIOLA, A.; NOACK, R.; ADAM, K. *Suddenly welcoming, Europe opens the door to refugees fleeing Ukraine*. The Washington Post. Available at: <https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/2022/02/28/ukraine-refugees-europe/>. Access in: 13/05/2022.

<sup>29</sup> KOO, J. *Protecting Ukrainians fleeing to the EU ... but for how long?* European Law Blog. News and Comments on EU Law. 10 March of 2022. Available at: <https://europeanlawblog.eu/2022/03/10/protecting-ukrainians-fleeing-to-the-eu-but-for-how-long/> Access in: 13/05/2022.

<sup>30</sup> HANKIR, H.; RABAH, H. *Arab refugees see double standards in Europe's embrace of Ukrainians*. Reuters. Available at: <https://www.reuters.com/world/arab-refugees-see-double-standards-europes-embrace-ukrainians-2022-03-02/>. Access in: 13/05/2022.

<sup>31</sup> CARVALHO DE VASCONCELOS, R.; CAMPOS DUTRA, D. *Direito Comparado e Política: Reflexões Necessárias*, Comparative Law and Politics: Some Reflections Needed. Brazilian Journal of International Law 17, no. 1 (April 2020): 42-56. P. 43. Original in Brazilian Portuguese. Available at: <https://www.publicacoesacademicas.uniceub.br/rdi/article/view/6241> Access in: 07/07/2022. P. 47.

subjects can, under these parameters, tarnish neutrality and consensus intended by international regulations<sup>32</sup>.

While migration governance refers to a broader group of people, encompassing migrants who do not qualify as refugees, reflecting adherence to international standards and fulfilment of migrants' rights<sup>33</sup>, the scope of this paper will be to analyse mainly the impact on the integration policies regarding the selected group of the refugees. Even though migration is usually mixed, "*including refugees fleeing persecution and conflict, victims of trafficking and people seeking better lives and opportunities*"<sup>34</sup>, considering refugees are a vulnerable group<sup>35</sup>, the hypothesis is that those impacts would be more substantial on them and, therefore, currently a more urgent study<sup>36</sup>.

In specific thematic contexts, such as the refugees' rights, the political and economic elements gain discursive contours. The effectiveness of human rights finds an obstacle in the difficulties of coercion of the international system that requires the adherence of the subjects of international law for its improvement. Adhesion that, under certain circumstances, integrates political and economic processes of a narrative constructed and that is not said, therefore, necessarily through endogenous movements of persuasion<sup>37</sup>.

It is also important to highlight that even more than two years later, the world is still "*in many ways grappling with a significant global upheaval caused by the severe pandemic and consequent economic crisis that has tested even the most resilient systems, countries, communities, and people*"<sup>38</sup>. As migration and displacement occur within broader dynamic long-term social, security, political and economic contexts, it is vital to recognize that the pandemic had impacts on the migration and integration policies worldwide in several aspects.

At the beginning of 2020, Covid-19, a new coronavirus, emerged and spread across the world in a series of waves; that was classified as a pandemic by the World Health Organization and "*affected countries on all continents, leading to the death of hundreds of thousands of people and impacting the lives of almost every person on the planet*"<sup>39</sup>. Although the COVID-19 pandemic is a health crisis, it is also an

---

<sup>32</sup> *Ibid.* P. 48

<sup>33</sup> UNITED NATIONS. IOM's Global Migration Data Analysis Centre (GMDAC). Global Migration Data Portal. *Migration Governance Framework*. Available at: [https://www.iom.int/sites/g/files/tmzbd1486/files/about-iom/migof\\_brochure\\_a4\\_en.pdf](https://www.iom.int/sites/g/files/tmzbd1486/files/about-iom/migof_brochure_a4_en.pdf). Access in 09/05/2022.

<sup>34</sup> MIXED MIGRATION CENTRE. The Mixed Migration Centre . *What is mixed migration?* Available at: <https://mixedmigration.org/about/>. Access in: 20/05/2022

<sup>35</sup> UNITED NATIONS. UN High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR). Vulnerability Screening Tool. *Identifying and addressing vulnerability: a tool for asylum and migration systems*. Available at: <https://www.unhcr.org/protection/detention/57fe30b14/unhcr-idx-vulnerability-screening-tool-identifying-addressing-vulnerability.html>. Access in: 20/05/2022.

<sup>36</sup> GAMMELTOFT-HANSEN, T.; FEITH TAN, N. *Access to Protection and International Responsibility-Sharing*, Ch.27 Extraterritorial Migration Control and Deterrence. In: Cathryn Costello, Michelle Foster, Jane McAdam. *The Oxford Handbook of International Refugee Law*. 3 June of 2021. Available in: Oxford Public International Law (<http://opil.ouplaw.com>). (c) Oxford University Press, 2022. Access in: 20 May 2022.

<sup>37</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>38</sup> MCAULIFFE, M.; TRIANDAFYLLIDOU, A. (eds.), 2021, *Op. Cit.* P. 21

<sup>39</sup> WHO. World Health Organization. *Director-General's opening remarks at the media briefing on COVID19* on 11 March 2020. Available at: <https://www.who.int/director-general/speeches/detail/who-director-general-s-opening-remarks-at-the-media-briefing-on-covid-19---11-march-2020#:~:text=WHO%20has%20been%20assessing%20this,to%20use%20lightly%20or%20carelessly>. Access in: 07/07/2022.

economic crisis, leading economies into recession with a 5.2 percent decline globally for 2020, the deepest recession since the end of the Second World War<sup>40</sup>.

The virus' rapid spread across borders was initially accompanied by the idea that it was a "democratic virus", which for Slavoj Žižek, "does not distinguish between poor and rich or between a statesman and ordinary people"<sup>41</sup>. Thus, according to the Slovenian philosopher, such democracy stemming from the virus would lead us to construct a more supportive world, in which differences would be overcome in favor of unity to find a solution to the end of the pandemic. Unfortunately, this idea was not reflected in practice, especially regarding the refugees' rights. As stated by Ranger and Slack, a contagious disease, an epidemic, "has no meaning in itself, it is only a microorganism that gains significance by the way it interferes in people's lives, the reactions it provokes, the cultural expression and the political values it acquires"<sup>42</sup>. The pandemic renewed the appeal of nationalist politics and anti-refugee sentiment, which globally endangers the integrity of the international protection regime and deepens refugees' vulnerabilities and the social gap between them and the local community.

As a first consequence, one can state the tension that has emerged between refugees and the policies implemented to stop the movement because of the pandemic, even though the existing human rights law provides for the right to leave any country and return to one's own country<sup>43</sup>. This right to leave one's own country does not come with a corresponding right to enter another country, and the decision to let is made at the state level. Based on the principle of *non-refoulement*<sup>44</sup>, this should not apply to refugees. Nevertheless, during the pandemic, countries even excluded asylum seekers from entry at land borders and pushed them back into countries of transit, which increased irregular migration and provided favorable ground to migrant trafficking and smuggling<sup>45</sup>.

Secondly, some refugees tried to escape from the virus itself, as well as economic hardship, given that "the lack of social protection for many would mean that not returning to their home countries would risk starvation and homelessness"<sup>46</sup>. This is an excellent example of how the pandemic created such despair that some refugees decided to return home to the countries they had fled in the first place.

Thirdly, refugees' vulnerability increased, especially because they were not supported by measures to protect vulnerable populations in the context of ongoing humanitarian displacement. The restrictions limited their integration into the local community and, consequently, their access to essential public goods, including health care<sup>47</sup>. Refugees were "often excluded from public benefits, including health insurance or unemployment insurance, and were especially excluded from health services or feared approaching hospitals or health institutions for fear of being detained or deported"<sup>48</sup>. Lots of them have lost their jobs and are homeless or forced

<sup>40</sup> IBDR+IDA. World Bank. Migration and Development Brief 34: *Resilience: COVID-19 Crisis Through a Migration Lens*. KNOMAD, World Bank, Washington, D.C. 2020. Available at [www.knomad.org/publication/migrationand-development-brief-34](http://www.knomad.org/publication/migrationand-development-brief-34). Access in: 07/07/2022.

<sup>41</sup> ŽIZEK, S. *El coronavirus es un golpe al capitalismo a lo Kill Bill...* In P. Amadeo (Org), *Sopa de Wuhan: pensamiento contemporáneo en tiempos de pandemias* (p. 21-28). Buenos Aires: Aspo Editorial. 2020. P. 22.

<sup>42</sup> GOULART, A. *Revisitando a espanhola: A gripe pandêmica de 1918 no Rio de Janeiro*. *História, Ciências, Saúde - Manguinhos*, 12(1), 101-142. 2021. P. 120.

<sup>43</sup> UN General Assembly. *Universal Declaration of Human Rights* (UNGA, 1948).

<sup>44</sup> UN General Assembly. *Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees*, 28 July 1951, United Nations, Treaty Series, vol. 189, p. 137. Available at: <https://www.refworld.org/docid/3be01b964.html>. Access in: 07/07/2022.

<sup>45</sup> MCAULIFFE, M.; TRIANDAFYLIDOU, A. (eds.), 2021, *Op. Cit.* P. 22.

<sup>46</sup> *Ibid*, P. 24.

<sup>47</sup> BERGMANN, M. *International Migration, Evolving Trends from Early Twentieth Century to Present*. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge. 2020. Available at [www.cambridge.org/core/books/international-migration/60893845597CB52B99F9C3ECC72199ED](http://www.cambridge.org/core/books/international-migration/60893845597CB52B99F9C3ECC72199ED). Access in: 07/07/2022.

<sup>48</sup> *Ibid*, P. 24.

to live in overcrowded conditions. In parallel, COVID-19 outbreaks were detected in refugee reception centers and in some countries, "people were asked to leave due to public health concerns related to higher risks of transmission within facilities"<sup>49</sup>.

Additionally, xenophobia and especially anti-Asian racism rose worldwide, with "some mass media, public figures, and political groups erroneously linking migrants and refugees to the spread of the virus"<sup>50</sup>. Thus, hate and discrimination against them in many countries globally were exacerbated due to misinformation and fears associated with the COVID-19 pandemic.

Lastly, all of these issues negatively affected the mental health of migrants worldwide. Being in "irregular situations, lacking social support networks from family and friends, and not understanding the language of the destination country are factors that worsen their vulnerability, making their emotional situation extremely precarious"<sup>51</sup>.

Hence, the pandemic improved the growth of autocratic tendencies that restrict diversity in populations and fuel anti-refugee sentiment, deliberately undermining and obscuring the refugees' rights and making the environment for post-pandemic migration and refugee protection recovery more challenging<sup>52</sup>. Besides that, the pandemic revealed and exacerbated pre-existing socioeconomic inequalities, including those of refugees, deepening the vulnerability of this group as labour markets contracted and job opportunities tightened significantly<sup>53</sup>, generating a new economic crisis that affected all levels of public policies as the integration policies as well. Thus, no community has been left untouched by the pandemic, but "the likelihood of having been directly affected by the pandemic and the consequent economic crisis is especially high for the refugees".

### 3. Integration Policies

The integration of migrants might be defined as "the degree to which migrants have the knowledge and capacity to build a successful, fulfilling life in the host society"<sup>54</sup>. While "knowledge entails aspects such as fluency in the national language and ability to navigate the host country's labour market and social institutions, the capacity refers to the mental, social, and economic resources migrants have to invest in their futures"<sup>55</sup>. There are multi-dimensional capacities and knowledge of migrants to settle in their new environment, but there are six which are considered to be the most important of them: psychological, linguistic, social, economic, political and navigational<sup>56</sup>.

The refugee protection logic is one of progressive accrual of rights over time. Because refugees cannot return to their countries of origin, they must be given a chance to start a new life and become integrated into a new community. While this "assimilative path" is generally accepted, absorption capacity becomes a severe issue when refugees arrive in large numbers. Suddenly, the basic standards appear

<sup>49</sup> MCAULIFFE, M.; TRIANDAFYLLIDOU, A. (eds.), 2021, *Op. Cit.* 23

<sup>50</sup> *Ibid.* P. 27

<sup>51</sup> BECKSTEIN, H. *Evaluación de la Evidencia: Cambio Climático y Migración en el Perú*. Potsdam Institute for Climate Impact Research. IOM, Geneva. 2020. Available at [https://peru.iom.int/sites/peru/files/Documentos/UMMC\\_MIGRACION\\_CC\\_PERU\\_GLOBAL.pdf](https://peru.iom.int/sites/peru/files/Documentos/UMMC_MIGRACION_CC_PERU_GLOBAL.pdf). Access in: 07/07/2022.

<sup>52</sup> MCAULIFFE, M.; TRIANDAFYLLIDOU, A. (eds.), 2021, *Op. Cit.* P. 25

<sup>53</sup> *Ibid.*, P. 27.

<sup>54</sup> UNITED NATIONS. IOM. *Integration of Venezuelan and Haitian Beneficiaries of IOM Cash-Based Intervention Programming in Brazil Key Findings from the Application of the IOM / IPL Migrant Integration Index Study Brief*. 2022. Available at: <https://brazil.iom.int/sites/g/files/tmzbd1496/files/documents/study-brief-integration-of-venezuelan-and-haitian.pdf>. Access in: 29/08/2022.

<sup>55</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>56</sup> *Ibid.*

extremely expansive and generous. The idea of "*more refugees, less asylum*" is increasingly presented as an inescapable equation<sup>57</sup>. Scholars in the field need to be wary of developments in domestic law and practice which reinforce this slant.

Even though a wave of solidarity has been glimpsed in the last months due to the Ukrainian war, the renewed appeal of nationalist politics and anti-refugee sentiment globally endangers the integrity of the international protection regime and international law at large. Therefore, further investigation is required of these dynamics that will dismantle the most fundamental principles of international refugee law if unchecked.

In Latin America, 18 of the 20 states are parties to both the Refugee Convention and its Protocol. Although the global refugee regime is virtually the same for all States that are parties to the Refugee Convention and its Protocol, the refugee definitions that are to be found in domestic legislation vary considerably. This results from a decades-long and uncoordinated process whereby the States have broadened the definition of a "refugee"<sup>58</sup>.

The protection of political asylees and refugees also draws on the regional human rights regime, the two most relevant instruments being the 1948 American Declaration of the Rights and Duties of Man and the 1969 American Convention on Human Rights. However, the Cartagena Declaration assumed an important role and had an unprecedented impact in Latin America, both on policy, legal developments, and the conduct of protection policy advocacy<sup>59</sup>.

In addition to the global and regional instruments, protection for asylees is generally found within national constitutions, while the legal framework for protecting political asylees and refugees in Latin America is usually found in domestic legislation<sup>60</sup>. The Mercosur Residence Agreement (MRA) provides two-year residence permits (by Argentina, Brazil, and Uruguay), while Colombia adopted a 10-year residence permit<sup>61</sup> in February 2021.

In the case of large-scale Venezuelan displacement, "*Brazil is the only South American country that has applied the Cartagena definition to significant numbers of Venezuelan nationals*"<sup>62</sup> and has a really broad definition in the Refugee Statute, which consists in one of the main reasons for its choice as a case study. Nonetheless, probably the best reason for studying Brazilian integration and migration governance initiatives is the "*Operação Acolhida*" or Operation Welcome<sup>63</sup>, created in March 2018, which is the Brazilian government's response to the large migratory flow from Venezuela due to the political, economic and social crisis. It is based on three pillars: border ordering, sheltering, and interiorization. The Interiorisation Process of Operation Welcome is the Federal Government's primary strategy to reduce the pressure on public services in the State of Roraima caused by the exponential increase in the migratory flow resulting from the humanitarian crisis in Venezuela and to promote socio-economic integration in Brazilian society. Consequently, it increases tolerance and raises public awareness, which are key initiatives for

---

<sup>57</sup> DURIEUX, J-F. *The Scope of Refugee Protection*. Ch.37 Temporary Protection and Temporary Refuge. In: Cathryn Costello, Michelle Foster, Jane McAdam. *The Oxford Handbook of International Refugee Law*. 3 June of 2021. Available in: Oxford Public International Law (<http://opil.ouplaw.com>). (c) Oxford University Press, 2022. Access in: 20 May 2022.

<sup>58</sup> FISCHER, J. *Regional Refugee Regimes: Latin America*. In: Cathryn Costello, Michelle Foster, Jane McAdam. *The Oxford Handbook of International Refugee Law*. 3 June of 2021. Available in: Oxford Public International Law (<http://opil.ouplaw.com>). (c) Oxford University Press, 2022. Access in: 20 May 2022. P. 18.

<sup>59</sup> FISCHER, J., 2022. *Op. Cit.* P. 25.

<sup>60</sup> FISCHER, J., 2022. *Op. Cit.* P. 30.

<sup>61</sup> CARRERA, S; INELI, M; LINA, C; BRUMAT, V. 2022. *Op. Cit.* P. 40.

<sup>62</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>63</sup> BRAZIL. Casa Civil. Governo Federal. "Sobre a operação acolhida". About Operation Welcome. Available at: <https://www.gov.br/casacivil/pt-br/acolhida/sobre-a-operacao-acolhida-2>. Access in: 13/05/2022.

achieving the ultimate goal of safeguarding individual freedoms and empowering migrants and civil society as a whole<sup>64</sup>.

It is essential to highlight that the third phase of this operation is already the most important one. Interiorisation is divided into four modalities, which are (I) institutional, (II) family reunification, (III) social gathering, and (IV) signalled job vacancy. The UNHCR supports all modalities and acts at all stages, be it before departure, during the trip, or even at the final destination. Specifically, in the institutional modality, which includes the departure of Venezuelan people from shelters in Roraima to reception and integration centers in other cities of destination, UNHCR works with non-governmental organizations and civil society entities to promote adequate reception and integration in the places of reception, promoting their peaceful coexistence with the host communities and local development<sup>65</sup>.

The Response for Venezuelans (R4V) platform<sup>66</sup> brings together 13 UN agencies and 37 civil society organizations. Its functions, among others, are elaborating a harmonized annual response plan to assist refugees and migrants and the actions of local governments. Interiorization is a priority for "Plataforma R4V Brasil". One of the work fronts is the sector dedicated exclusively to discussing this strategy, how to support the Federal Government in its implementation and how to train the receiving states and municipalities to facilitate the process of integration of these people in the places of destination. In addition, cross-cutting discussions on the topic take place in other sectors, such as Shelter, Education, Protection, Health, WASH (Water, Sanitation, and Hygiene), and Nutrition<sup>67</sup>.

Another good example would be the above mentioned platform "MigraCidades: Improving Local Migration Governance in Brazil", the result of a partnership between the International Organization for Migration (IOM) and the Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul (UFRGS), with the support of the National School of Public Administration, which aims to train local actors, boost migratory dialogue, certify government engagement in improving migratory governance and give visibility to good practices identified in Brazilian states and municipalities.

Unlike the huge contingent of refugees that occupy the political debate in Europe, Latin America has a body of historical minorities highly damaged by years of exploitation and genocide. The situation in South America, where its minorities are concerned, has a different gravity. It is a historical exclusion - economic and political - of a huge contingent of individuals who, for the most diverse reasons, had precisely their ethnicity as the basis for the withdrawal of their citizenship. When entering a social limbo, Latin American ethnic minorities, notably indigenous and black quilombolas, suffered a series of abuses of their most fundamental rights and the exercise of their autonomy as a high assimilationist and excluding cultural pattern is established. Thus, reducing the autonomy of these peoples. In short: they have become invisible. The seriousness of the situation necessarily requires more incisive responses for a possible rebalancing<sup>68</sup>.

---

<sup>64</sup> UNITED NATIONS. ACNUR/UNHCR. *Temas específicos: interiorização*. Specific topics: interiorization. Available at: <https://www.acnur.org/portugues/temas-especificos/interiorizacao/>. Access in: 13/05/2022.

<sup>65</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>66</sup> BRAZIL. *Plataforma Regional de Coordenação Interagencial R4V (Response for Venezuelans)*. Available at: <https://www.r4v.info/pt/brazil>. Access in: 07/07/2022.

<sup>67</sup> UNITED NATIONS. ACNUR/UNHCR. *Conheça a estratégia que já transformou a vida de 50 mil refugiados e migrantes venezuelanos no Brasil*. Discover the strategy that has already transformed the lives of 50,000 Venezuelan refugees and migrants in Brazil. Available at: <https://www.acnur.org/portugues/2021/04/20/conheca-a-estrategia-que-ja-transformou-a-vida-de-50-mil-refugiados-e-migrantes-venezuelanos-no-brasil/>. Access in: 13/05/2022.

<sup>68</sup> CAMPOS DUTRA, D. *Multiculturalismo e Direito no País das Minorias Invisíveis: Fundamentos e Proposições para uma Nova Leitura da Identidade Constitucional Brasileira*. Multiculturalism and Law in the Country of Invisible Minorities: Foundations and Propositions for a New Reading of Brazilian Constitutional Identity. *Revista do Direito*, (53), 67-91. 2017. Original in Brazilian

In the Brazilian context, although Brazilian legislation is suitable for international standards, the society's treatment of immigrants brings worries<sup>69</sup>. The illusory image of a country made up of people from different continents and marked by the celebration of diversity is deconstructed daily<sup>70</sup>. The reception and integration as an immigrant are particularly dramatic for Venezuelans. When the individual arrives on Brazilian soil, in addition to dealing with culture shock and language difficulties, seeking protection for himself and a job that guarantees his livelihood and security in the future. However, this path can be hampered by prejudice, xenophobia, and lack of information<sup>71</sup>. In this context, it is necessary to implement the notion of "integration" among the Brazilian population since the society that receives the migrants is not a homogeneous body of citizens and how the dissemination of knowledge can contribute to ending xenophobic episodes.

Thus, even though integration policies have been developing recently in the Brazilian context, there is still a sort of challenges that need to be faced. Among them, the economic factor is one of the most relevant. Thus, in the next topic, we are going to work on the main intersection points between the integration policies and the public budget.

#### **4. Integration policies and the public budget.**

The question of budgetary nature and the realization of fundamental rights, at the state legal level, passes, in a certain way, through the constitutional model adopted by a given state<sup>72</sup>. The Brazilian constitution establishes the democratic state of law. It was based on citizenship, and in the principle of human dignity, its text was primarily concerned with the affirmation and guarantee of rights. The issue of migration does not appear directly in the constitutional text, but there was an equalization between Brazilians and foreigners in the exercise and guarantee of most fundamental rights.

Article 5 of the Federal Constitution deals with fundamental rights and, in its *caput*, mentions foreigners as follows: "*all are equal before the law, without distinction of any nature, guaranteeing Brazilians and foreigners residing in the country the inviolability of the right to life, liberty, equality, security and property*"<sup>73</sup>. It is important to note that even though the provision refers to foreign that has a residence in Brazil, the Supreme Court has already positioned many times in the sense that the foreigner, even those without residence in the country, is entitled to

---

Portuguese. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.17058/rdunisc.v3i53.10477>. Access in: 07/07/2022. P. 85.

<sup>69</sup> UEBEL, R.; BRÍGIDO, E.; RIBEIRO, V. *Evolução da governança migratória no Brasil: desafios teóricos, mudanças normativas e ecos sociais de sentimentos xenofóbicos*. Ideias, Campinas, SP, v.11, 1-30, 2020. P. 4

<sup>70</sup> Carta Capital. News: "*Sai do meu país!*": *agressão a refugiado expõe a xenofobia no Brasil*. 2019. Available at: <https://www.cartacapital.com.br/politica/saia-do-meu-pais-agressao-a-refugiado-no-rio-expoe-a-xenofobia-no-brasil>. Access in: 06/09/2022.

<sup>71</sup> AGUIAR, R. *O governo de Jair Bolsonaro e o impacto sobre refugiados no Brasil*. Publicado em outubro 27, 2020. PUCMINAS. Conjuntura. 2021. Available at: <https://pucminasconjuntura.wordpress.com/2020/10/27/o-governo-de-jair-bolsonaro-e-o-impacto-sobre-refugiados-no-brasil/>. Access in: 12/08/2022.

<sup>72</sup> GUERRA, S.; CARNEIRO, C. *Direitos Sociais x orçamento público: possibilidades e limites*. GOVERNAT. BOLETIM DO ORÇAMENTO E FINANÇAS, v. 181, 2020. P. 423-433.

<sup>73</sup> BRAZIL. *Constituição da República Federativa do Brasil de 1988*. Constitution of the Federative Republic of Brazil of 1988. Available at: [http://www.planalto.gov.br/ccivil\\_03/constituicao/constituicao.htm](http://www.planalto.gov.br/ccivil_03/constituicao/constituicao.htm). Access in: 08/07/2022.

all applicable fundamental rights guaranteed by the constitution as a replacement for the penalty<sup>74</sup>, due process of law<sup>75</sup> and gratuitousness of justice<sup>76</sup>.

Furthermore, it makes no sense to argue that Article 5 limits equal rights to resident and documented immigrants since it mentions that "*all are equal before the law, without distinction of any kind*" before restricting guarantees of rights "*to Brazilians and foreigners residing in the country*". In that case, the interpretation "*pro homine*" and consonant with the defence of human rights, enshrined in the same Article 5, must understand the concept of residence broadly, in the sense of abode, and not the legal limitation of those immigrants who obtained a residence permit under the terms of the legislation<sup>77</sup>. After all, regardless of their migratory status, every immigrant has the inviolable right to life, liberty, equality, security and property, as the Constitution recommends.

Indeed, as to the list of Fundamental Rights provided in the Brazilian Constitution of the Republic of 1988 that could be extended to the refugees, the economic and social issue is the most interesting, since Brazil has experienced severe economic crises, which even today compromises, to some extent, the governability of the country<sup>78</sup>. One cannot forget that the years preceding the 1988 Constitution, more precisely from 1984 to 1987, were difficult years for the country's economy, namely: the increase in foreign debt, the so-called "galloping" inflation, devaluation of the currency, and, consequently, the recession and the increase in social inequality<sup>79</sup>.

For Fabio Oliveira<sup>80</sup>, the 1988 Constitution, before initiating the Brazilian directive constitutionalism, innovates in the model of directiveism that it undertakes and is the most programmatic of all Brazilian Constitutions. However, it is not the most nationalistic of all the charters Brazil has ever had, nor is it the one that most advocates state intervention in the economy<sup>81</sup>.

Under the programmatic prism of a Constitution, three elements deserve to be highlighted: the existential minimum, the reserve of the possible and the prohibition of retrogression. This is because the issues involving social rights, which, as a rule, demand a positive action from the State, produce ramifications in relation to the public budget, hence the assertion that these rights demand public spending<sup>82</sup>.

It is worth pointing out, from the outset, that the state must intervene on behalf of the weakest, including the migrants<sup>83</sup>, and that the budgetary issue cannot be viewed in an absolute manner. The primacy of the principle of human dignity<sup>84</sup>, which must be protected and promoted by public authorities and society, must bear

---

<sup>74</sup> BRAZIL. Supreme Court. *Habeas Corpus 94.477*, Gilmar Mendes, 2012. Available at: <https://portal.stf.jus.br/processos/detalhe.asp?incidente=2611959>. Access in: 08/07/2022.

<sup>75</sup> BRAZIL. Supreme Court. *Habeas Corpus 94.016*, Celso de Mello, 2009. Available at: <https://portal.stf.jus.br/processos/detalhe.asp?incidente=2601323>. Access in: 08/07/2022.

<sup>76</sup> BRAZIL. Supreme Court. *Recurso Especial 1.018.911*, Luiz Fux, 2021. Available at: <https://portal.stf.jus.br/processos/detalhe.asp?incidente=5115280https://portal.stf.jus.br/processos/detalhe.asp?incidente=2601323>. Access in: 08/07/2022.

<sup>77</sup> CLARO, C. *Do Estatuto do Estrangeiro à Lei de Migração: Avanços e Expectativas*. From the Foreigner Statute to the Migration Law: Advances and Expectations. 2020. Available at: [http://repositorio.ipea.gov.br/bitstream/11058/9820/1/BEPI\\_n26\\_Estatuto.pdf](http://repositorio.ipea.gov.br/bitstream/11058/9820/1/BEPI_n26_Estatuto.pdf). Access in: 06/07/2022.

<sup>78</sup> GUERRA, S. *Direitos humanos: curso elementar*. 5. Ed. São Paulo: Saraiva, 2017. P. 111.

<sup>79</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>80</sup> OLIVEIRA, F. *Morte e Vida da Constituição Dirigente*. Rio de Janeiro: Lumen Juris. 2010. p. 213.

<sup>81</sup> Sidney Guerra. *Op. Cit.* P. 42

<sup>82</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>83</sup> FERRAJOLI, L. *Derechos y garantías: la ley del más débil*. Madrid: Trotta, 2006. p. 108.

<sup>84</sup> Sidney Guerra. *Op. Cit.* P. 42

in mind the normative force of the Constitution<sup>85</sup> and the fact that all rights cost money<sup>86</sup>.

In this sense, "The cost of rights" was the main theme of the research developed by Stephen Holmes and Cass Sustein, in the United States of America. In that work, the authors demonstrate that all rights, regardless of their classification, necessarily imply an economic cost. Even the so-called first-dimension rights, entitled as negative rights (state abstention), also require public power resources for their preservation, such as, for example, spending on public security in order to preserve freedom<sup>87</sup>. This, in itself, would already be a preponderant factor for the theoretical support of the public entities, of the so alleged limitation of financial resources<sup>88</sup> for the State to justify the non-compliance with fundamental rights.

The essential function of social rights and the expansion of its scope to migrants and refugees is to provide material equality by narrowing existing inequalities, and therefore, they have the same fundamentality as other rights. In the Brazilian case of "Operação Acolhida", for example, overall, the interiorization shows concrete improvements in people's lives, particularly in terms of income, occupation and local integration. For example, the data point to some positive results among the beneficiaries of the Internalization Strategy compared to people sheltered in Roraima regarding unemployment. While the unemployment rate of the internalized population is 17.8%, the sheltered people face almost double - 30.8%. Another good example relates to the education of children under 18. While 67.6% of children and young people living in the interior are enrolled in school, only 41.3% were attending schools as sheltered children. Thus, the interiorized children have more than 50% more access to a school than children that remains in the shelter<sup>89</sup>.

Besides that, internalized Venezuelans are potentially earning higher wages than the sheltered. The average income of Venezuelans benefiting from the Internalization Strategy is R\$ 1,325<sup>90</sup>, a little above the minimum wage in Brazil and about half of the average income of the Brazilian population. But Venezuelans who remain sheltered in Roraima receive an average income of R\$ 595<sup>91</sup>, less than the minimum wage in Brazil and almost three times less than the average income of the resident population in Roraima<sup>92</sup>.

Recent data also reveal the great potential for expanding the Strategy for Internalization with the sheltered population in Roraima, since 76.2% of sheltered people are interested in leaving the state, and 59.3% have already registered to participate in the Strategy and be relocated of Roraima<sup>93</sup>.

---

<sup>85</sup> CARNEIRO, C. *Compliance e Boa Governança (Pública e Privada)*. Curitiba: Juruá. 2018. P. 106.

<sup>86</sup> HOLMES, S.; SUSTEIN, R. *The Cost of Rights. Why liberty depends on taxes*. New York – London: Norton & Company. 2012. Pag. 15-48.

<sup>87</sup> Sidney Guerra. *Op. Cit.* P. 44.

<sup>88</sup> CARNEIRO, C. *Curso de Direito Tributário e Financeiro*. 8. Ed. São Paulo: Saraiva. 2019. P. 82.

<sup>89</sup> UNITED NATIONS. UNHCR. *Limites e desafios à integração local de refugiadas, refugiados e pessoas migrantes da Venezuela interiorizadas durante a pandemia de Covid-19*. Limits and challenges to the local integration of refugees, refugees and migrants from Venezuela internalized during the Covid-19 Pandemic. 2021. Available at: <https://www.acnur.org/portugues/wp-content/uploads/2021/12/Sumario-Executivo-Limites-e-desafios-a-integracao-local-de-refugiadas-refugiados-e-pessoas-migrantes-da-Venezuela-interiorizadas-durante-a-pandemia-de-Covid-19-dez.2021.pdf>. Access in: 21/07/2022.

<sup>90</sup> According to the Brazilian Central Bank Official Website currency exchange (<https://www.bcb.gov.br/conversao>), the exact amount in American Dollars of this wage would be USD242,00 at 21/07/2022.

<sup>91</sup> According to the Brazilian Central Bank Official Website currency exchange (<https://www.bcb.gov.br/conversao>), the exact amount in American Dollars of this wage would be USD108,67 at 21/07/2022.

<sup>92</sup> United Nations. UNHCR. *Op. Cit.*

<sup>93</sup> *Ibid.*

Despite so many positive data, the interiorization strategy of "*Operação Acolhida*" also faces challenging scenarios. As the integration of refugees into the local Community is strongly remarked by the advantages and disadvantages that place offers, many of the biggest Brazilian social problems also end up affecting refugees. For example, sexism and racism are extremely present.

Both internalized and sheltered women are more likely than men to be unemployed or underemployed. Women, especially black women, also earn a lower average income than men when employed<sup>94</sup>. Recently, these gender dimensions are being taken into account when formulating policies aimed at the Venezuelan population and during policy dialogues on protecting women's rights<sup>95</sup> and other potentially marginalized groups such as the LGBTQIA+ population.

In addition, it is essential to note that Venezuelans who joined the Interiorization Strategy have higher educational levels, are more proficient in Portuguese and are more likely to be men than the population that remains in the shelter. These results may point to some selectivity of the target population that is benefited by the strategy<sup>96</sup>, which should also be taken into consideration when elaborating integration policies, especially those directed toward the education and training of those people.

Nonetheless, "*Operação Acolhida*" and the strategy of interiorization were fundamental to finding more sustainable solutions for the Brazilian affected areas (mainly Roraima and Manaus) and mainly for the Venezuelan refugees and migrants, as including local integration and insertion in the labour market across the country, even if still not meeting the ideal standards. This pillar has given rise to new dynamics of spatialization of Venezuelans through Brazil, bringing as a consequence one of the greatest legacies of "*Operação Acolhida*": the expansion of reception regions for these people made the entire country have contact with the topic of protection of refugees and began to develop private and public integration policies. Consequently, it increases tolerance and raises public awareness, which are key initiatives for achieving the ultimate goal of safeguarding individual freedoms and empowering migrants and civil society as a whole.

All things considered, in order to achieve the positive effects of the integration policies, the fulfilment of the promises of modernity requires an active posture from the state in designing and implementing integration policies and, for this, the financial issue could be invoked once again. Hence, the question is whether the unrestrained allegation of the reserve of the possible would put into question the "discretion" in the application of public resources and whether this argument could be used for the ineffectiveness of social rights.

On the one hand, it is important to avoid the legal ineffectiveness of various constitutional provisions on social rights, that is, the materiality of the principle of human dignity should not be confused with the existential minimum and, therefore, the existential minimum should not be reduced to the right to subsist. On the other hand, in face of the broad catalog of social rights, one cannot disregard the budgetary issues and the public deficit created by the economic crises. After all, to a certain extent, Holmes and Sustain are right, in the sense that all rights, regardless of the classification that is attributed to them, necessarily imply some economic cost<sup>97</sup>.

Bearing in mind the importance of integration and social rights, it is possible to verify the vulnerability of attributing a purely economic-budgetary bias to discuss the effectiveness of them. However, there is no way to ignore the budget argument, because although it is not an absolute conception that the relationship is direct, it is

---

<sup>94</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>95</sup> See, for example: UNITED NATIONS. UNHCR. *Empoderando refugiadas*. Empowering refugees. Available at: <https://www.acnur.org/portugues/empoderando-refugiadas/>. Access in: 21/07/2022.

<sup>96</sup> United Nations. UNHCR. *Op. Cit.*

<sup>97</sup> Sidney Guerra. *Op. Cit.*

a fact that without public revenue it is impossible to make expenditures. This, therefore, is the great challenge of any good governance, including migration governance. The idea is to optimize the resources in favour of certain rights with the proper use of the budget allocation and the public choice regarding which portfolio should be prioritized<sup>98</sup>. Taking this into account allows the state to design and implement much more precise integration policies and deal with the challenges related to them in a realistic way. Thus, the refugees' rights should not be challenged and relativized by political and economic realities all over the world<sup>99</sup>.

## 5. Conclusion

In recent years, countries have been struggling to cope with refugee crises and their consequences on the internal community. As seen before, these migratory flows already cause truculence even among nationals and lead to the proliferation of xenophobic popular manifestations against immigrants, often based on the consequentialist and utilitarian economic bias, either by fear of insufficient resources or by the increase in unemployment that ends up triggering an upsurge of the population in relation to the reception of foreigners.

With the intensification of social displacements, expulsions, war and precariousness of human life, controlling the movement of transnational migrants, refugees and asylum seekers has become a priority for public agendas of multilateral agencies and national governments. Many times, these actors adhere to the protection of the human being, contribute to the construction of discourse on the universality of these rights, and, when confronted with the need to act definitively to promote the materialized in the norm, are reluctant. Political and economic needs create the right, and the same factors later resist the efficiency of the established normative body.

The vanguard of the Brazilian law for the protection of refugees, the Refugee Statute (Law No. 9,474 of 1997), which in 2022 celebrates 25 years of its enactment, consolidated itself in practices and advances, such as the fundamental expansion of CONARE and its installation in locations besides Brasília, such as Rio de Janeiro, São Paulo and Campinas, seeking to benefit all refugees in a country of continental dimensions. At the same time, the Brazilian initiative, "*Operação Acolhida*", for sure has many positive impacts.

The evidence shown in this thesis points to the need to plan medium and long-term public policies that support the integration process and continued socioeconomic inclusion of the Venezuelan population in Brazil. The data corroborate the importance of emphasizing an integration policy based on territorial dispersion. The analysis leaves no doubt that gender, race and ethnicity lead to structural inequalities experienced by Venezuelans before, during and after the relocation process, and specific policies must address these differences.

However, little is known about the living conditions of these beneficiaries in the post-internalization period, and new research is necessary to fill this gap, investigating the results observed for the beneficiaries in terms of integration to the labour market, generation of income and vulnerabilities linked to socioeconomic conditions, access to social rights and social protection services, in particular education and health, with special emphasis on the specific vulnerabilities of women and children.

To ensure a favourable environment for refugee integration, it is necessary for a multisectoral response focusing on protection, reception and shelter, material assistance and the longest part of this process, integration. For this purpose, it is essential that the local policies are organised to provide information on rights and available services, identify vulnerabilities and refer to relevant services, and monitor

---

<sup>98</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>99</sup> *Ibid.*

and reinforce reception and integration conditions while ensuring basic needs are met.

This scenario requires a legal and factual effort to compose diverse objectives, whose simultaneous fulfilment is problematic and paradoxical, because even if one right could be fully guaranteed, it could, at least hypothetically, conflict with the satisfaction of others. In this case, weighing them would be a complex task, to say the least. This is because the question of the effectiveness of social rights associated with the fulfilment of the principle of the reserve of the possible, given the situations of scarcity faced by the state, should not be taken absolutely or as a dogma of the globalized economy, but also cannot be disregarded since it directly involves principles of public administration and good governance. Thus, the proposal of a reflection on this issue is apparently paradoxical.

However, we suggest the formal implementation of a hybrid model, which combines the optimization of resources by using the maximum possible, within the constitutional budget rules, to promote the effectiveness of the mentioned rights. This means that, while the scarcity of resources is identified, good governance suggests the optimization of existing resources by establishing priorities for their use according to the fundamental right involved. It is a matter, therefore, of facing the problem of scarcity as a limiting element and not as an absolute inability to satisfy multiple objectives under restrictions. After all, even though all rights cost money, fundamental rights in the light of the new constitutional conception should be mutually compatible and complementary.

## 6. Bibliography

- AGUIAR, R. *O governo de Jair Bolsonaro e o impacto sobre refugiados no Brasil*. Publicado em outubro 27, 2020. PUCMINAS. Conjuntura. 2021. Available at: <https://pucminasconjuntura.wordpress.com/2020/10/27/o-governo-de-jair-bolsonaro-e-o-impacto-sobre-refugiados-no-brasil/>. Access in: 12/08/2022.
- BECKSTEIN, H. *Evaluación de la Evidencia: Cambio Climático y Migración en el Perú*. Potsdam Institute for Climate Impact Research. IOM, Geneva. 2020. Available at [https://peru.iom.int/sites/peru/files/Documentos/UMMC\\_MIGRACION\\_CC\\_PERU\\_GLOBAL.pdf](https://peru.iom.int/sites/peru/files/Documentos/UMMC_MIGRACION_CC_PERU_GLOBAL.pdf). Access in: 07/07/2022.
- BERGMANN, M. *International Migration, Evolving Trends from Early Twentieth Century to Present*. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge. 2020. Available at [www.cambridge.org/core/books/international-migration/60893845597CB52B99F9C3ECC72199ED](http://www.cambridge.org/core/books/international-migration/60893845597CB52B99F9C3ECC72199ED). Access in: 07/07/2022.
- BRAZIL. Casa Civil. Governo Federal. "Sobre a operação acolhida". About Operation Welcome. Available at: <https://www.gov.br/casacivil/pt-br/acolhida/sobre-a-operacao-acolhida-2>. Access in: 13/05/2022.
- BRAZIL. *Constituição da República Federativa do Brasil de 1988*. Constitution of the Federative Republic of Brazil of 1988. Available at: [http://www.planalto.gov.br/ccivil\\_03/constituicao/constituicao.htm](http://www.planalto.gov.br/ccivil_03/constituicao/constituicao.htm). Access in: 08/07/2022.
- BRAZIL. *Plataforma Regional de Coordenação Interagencial R4V (Response for Venezuelans)*. Available at: <https://www.r4v.info/pt/brazil>. Access in: 07/07/2022.
- BRAZIL. Supreme Court. *Habeas Corpus 94.016*, Celso de Mello, 2009. Available at: <https://portal.stf.jus.br/processos/detalhe.asp?incidente=2601323>. Access in: 08/07/2022.
- BRAZIL. Supreme Court. *Habeas Corpus 94.477*, Gilmar Mendes, 2012. Available at: <https://portal.stf.jus.br/processos/detalhe.asp?incidente=2611959>. Access in: 08/07/2022.
- BRAZIL. Supreme Court. *Recurso Especial 1.018.911*, Luiz Fux, 2021. Available at: <https://portal.stf.jus.br/processos/detalhe.asp?incidente=5115280https://portal.stf.jus.br/processos/detalhe.asp?incidente=2601323>. Access in: 08/07/2022.
- CAMPOS DUTRA, D. *Multiculturalismo e Direito no País das Minorias Invisíveis: Fundamentos e Proposições para uma Nova Leitura da Identidade Constitucional Brasileira*. Multiculturalism and Law in the Country of Invisible Minorities: Foundations and Propositions for a New Reading of Brazilian Constitutional Identity. *Revista do Direito*, (53), 67-91. 2017. Original in

- Brazilian Portuguese. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.17058/rdunisc.v3i53.10477>. Access in: 07/07/2022. P. 85.
- CARNEIRO, C. *Curso de Direito Tributário e Financeiro*. 8. Ed. São Paulo: Saraiva. 2019.
- CARNEIRO, C. *Compliance e Boa Governança (Pública e Privada)*. Curitiba: Juruá. 2018.
- CARRERA, S; INELI, M; LINA, C; BRUMAT, V. CEPS Policy Insights No 2022-09. *The EU Grants Temporary Protection for People Fleeing War in Ukraine. Time to rethink unequal solidarity in EU asylum policy*. 2022. Available at: <https://www.ceps.eu/ceps-publications/eu-grants-temporary-protection-for-people-fleeing-war-in-ukraine/>. Access in: 12/05/2022.
- Carta Capital. News: "Sai do meu país!": agressão a refugiado expõe a xenofobia no Brasil. 2019. Available at: <https://www.cartacapital.com.br/politica/saia-do-meu-pais-agressao-a-refugiado-no-rio-expoe-a-xenofobia-no-brasil>. Access in: 06/09/2022.
- CARVALHO DE VASCONCELOS, R.; CAMPOS DUTRA, D. *Direito Comparado e Política: Reflexões Necessárias*, Comparative Law and Politics: Some Reflections Needed. Brazilian Journal of International Law 17, no. 1 (April 2020): 42-56. P. 43. Original in Brazilian Portuguese. Available at: <https://www.publicacoesacademicas.uniceub.br/rdi/article/view/6241> Access in: 07/07/2022.
- CLARO, C. *Do Estatuto do Estrangeiro à Lei de Migração: Avanços e Expectativas*. From the Foreigner Statute to the Migration Law: Advances and Expectations. 2020. Available at: [http://repositorio.ipea.gov.br/bitstream/11058/9820/1/BEPI\\_n26\\_Estatuto.pdf](http://repositorio.ipea.gov.br/bitstream/11058/9820/1/BEPI_n26_Estatuto.pdf). Access in: 06/07/2022.
- Colloquium on the International Protection of Refugees in Central America, Mexico and Panama. Regional Refugee Instruments & Related, *Cartagena Declaration on Refugees*. 22 November 1984. Available at: [https://www.oas.org/dil/1984\\_cartagena\\_declaration\\_on\\_refugees.pdf](https://www.oas.org/dil/1984_cartagena_declaration_on_refugees.pdf). Access in: 13/05/2022.
- DURIEUX, J-F. *The Scope of Refugee Protection*. Ch.37 Temporary Protection and Temporary Refuge. In: Cathryn Costello, Michelle Foster, Jane McAdam. The Oxford Handbook of International Refugee Law. 3 June of 2021. Available in: Oxford Public International Law (<http://opil.ouplaw.com>). (c) Oxford University Press, 2022. Access in: 20 May 2022.
- EUROPEAN UNION. Council of the European Union. *Press release, 2618th Council Meeting Justice and Home Affairs*. Council conclusions. Brussels, 19 November 2004. P. 15. Available at: [https://ec.europa.eu/migrant-integration/library-document/common-basic-principles-immigrant-integration-policy-eu\\_en](https://ec.europa.eu/migrant-integration/library-document/common-basic-principles-immigrant-integration-policy-eu_en). Access in: 10/05/2022
- FAIOLA, A.; NOACK, R.; ADAM, K. *Suddenly welcoming, Europe opens the door to refugees fleeing Ukraine*. The Washington Post. Available at: <https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/2022/02/28/ukraine-refugees-europe/>. Access in: 13/05/2022.
- FERRAJOLI, L. *Derechos y garantías: la ley del más débil*. Madrid: Trotta, 2006.
- FISCHEL, J. *Regional Refugee Regimes: Latin America*. In: Cathryn Costello, Michelle Foster, Jane McAdam. The Oxford Handbook of International Refugee Law. 3 June of 2021. Available in: Oxford Public International Law (<http://opil.ouplaw.com>). (c) Oxford University Press, 2022. Access in: 20 May 2022. P. 18.
- FREIER, F.L.; GAUCI, J.P. Refugee Rights Across Regions: A Comparative Overview of Legislative Good Practices in Latin America and the EU', *Refugee Survey Quarterly*, 39(3), 2020. P. 321-362.
- GAMMELTOFT-HANSEN, T.; FEITH TAN, N. *Access to Protection and International Responsibility-Sharing*, Ch.27 Extraterritorial Migration Control and Deterrence. In: Cathryn Costello, Michelle Foster, Jane McAdam. The Oxford Handbook of International Refugee Law. 3 June of 2021. Available in: Oxford Public International Law (<http://opil.ouplaw.com>). (c) Oxford University Press, 2022. Access in: 20 May 2022.
- GOULART, A. *Revisitando a espanhola: A gripe pandêmica de 1918 no Rio de Janeiro*. História, Ciências, Saúde - Manguinhos, 12(1), 101-142. 2021. P. 120.
- Government of Poland. Poland in Nigeria. News. *Important notice: crossing Ukrainian-Polish border*. Available at: <https://www.gov.pl/web/nigeria-en/important-notice-crossing-ukrainian-polish-border>. Access in: 13/05/2022.
- GUERRA, S. *Direitos humanos: curso elementar*. 5. Ed. São Paulo: Saraiva, 2017.

- GUERRA, S.; CARNEIRO, C. *Direitos Sociais x orçamento público: possibilidades e limites*. GOVERNET. BOLETIM DO ORÇAMENTO E FINANÇAS, v. 181, 2020. P. 423-433.
- GUERRA, S.; EMERIQUE, L. *Minority rights and vulnerable groups*. Ijuí: Unijuí, 2008.
- HANKIR, H.; RABAH, H. *Arab refugees see double standards in Europe's embrace of Ukrainians*. Reuters. Available at: <https://www.reuters.com/world/arab-refugees-see-double-standards-europes-embrace-ukrainians-2022-03-02/>. Access in: 13/05/2022.
- HOLMES, S.; SUSTEIN, R. *The Cost of Rights. Why liberty depends on taxes*. New York – London: Norton & Company. 2012. Pag. 15-48.
- IBDR+IDA. World Bank. Migration and Development Brief 34: *Resilience: COVID-19 Crisis Through a Migration Lens*. KNOMAD, World Bank, Washington, D.C. 2020. Available at [www.knomad.org/publication/migrationand-development-brief-34](http://www.knomad.org/publication/migrationand-development-brief-34). Access in: 07/07/2022.
- KOLDINSKÁ, K. *ILO Pioneering on Domestic Workers – Migrant Women Issues*. Hungarian Journal of Legal Studies 59, No 4, pp. 420–431 (2018) DOI: 10.1556/2052.2018.59.4.6. P. 420.
- KOO, J. *Protecting Ukrainians fleeing to the EU ... but for how long?* European Law Blog. *News and Comments on EU Law*. 10 March of 2022. Available at: <https://europeanlawblog.eu/2022/03/10/protecting-ukrainians-fleeing-to-the-eu-but-for-how-long/> Access in: 13/05/2022.
- MCAULIFFE, M.; TRIANDAFYLIDOU, A. (eds.), 2021. *World Migration Report 2022*. International Organization for Migration (IOM), Geneva, p. 14. Available at: <https://publications.iom.int/books/world-migration-report-2022>. Access in: 12/05/2022.
- MIXED MIGRATION CENTRE. The Mixed Migration Centre . *What is mixed migration?* Available at: <https://mixedmigration.org/about/>. Access in: 20/05/2022
- OLIVEIRA, F. *Morte e Vida da Constituição Dirigente*. Rio de Janeiro: Lumen Juris. 2010. p. 213.
- Regional Refugee Instruments & Related, *Brazil Declaration and Plan of Action*, 3 December 2014 Available at: <https://www.unhcr.org/brazil-declaration.html>. Access in: 13/05/2022.
- Regional Refugee Instruments & Related, *Mexico Declaration and Plan of Action to Strengthen International Protection of Refugees in Latin America*, 16 November 2004. Available at: <https://www.unhcr.org/455443b30.pdf>. Access in: 13/05/2022.
- Regional Refugee Instruments, *San José Declaration on Refugees and Displaced Persons*, 7 December 1994. Available at: <https://www.refworld.org/docid/4a54bc3fd.html>. Access in: 13/05/2022.
- TENDAYI ACHIUME; E. *Part I International Refugee Law— Reflections on the Scholarly Field*, Ch.2 Race, Refugees, and International Law. In: Cathryn Costello, Michelle Foster, Jane McAdam. *The Oxford Handbook of International Refugee Law*. 3 June of 2021. Available in: Oxford Public International Law (<http://opil.ouplaw.com>). (c) Oxford University Press, 2022. Access in: 20 May 2022.
- UEBEL, R.; BRÍGIDO, E.; RIBEIRO, V. *Evolução da governança migratória no Brasil: desafios teóricos, mudanças normativas e ecos sociais de sentimentos xenofóbicos*. Ideias, Campinas, SP, v.11, 1-30 , 2020.
- UFRGS. Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul. *A plataforma migracidades*. The Platform migracidades. Available at: <https://www.ufrgs.br/migracidades/>. Access in: 09/05/2022.
- UN General Assembly. *Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees*, 28 July 1951, United Nations, Treaty Series, vol. 189, p. 137. Available at: <https://www.refworld.org/docid/3be01b964.html>. Access in: 07/07/2022.
- UN General Assembly. *Universal Declaration of Human Rights* (UNGA, 1948).
- UNITED NATIONS. A/RES/70/1 - *Transforming our world: the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development*. The central reference to migration is made in Target 10.7 to facilitate orderly, safe, regular and responsible migration and mobility of people, including through the implementation of planned and well-managed migration policies. Available at: <https://sdgs.un.org/2030agenda>. Access in: 12/05/2022.
- UNITED NATIONS. A/RES/73/195 - *the Global Compact for Safe, Orderly and Regular Migration (GCM)* - Resolution adopted by the General Assembly on 19 December 2018, p. 1. Available at: [https://refugeesmigrants.un.org/sites/default/files/180711\\_final\\_draft\\_0.pdf](https://refugeesmigrants.un.org/sites/default/files/180711_final_draft_0.pdf). Access in: 12/05/2022
- UNITED NATIONS. ACNUR/UNHCR. *Conheça a estratégia que já transformou a vida de 50 mil refugiados e migrantes venezuelanos no Brasil*. Discover the strategy that has already

- transformed the lives of 50,000 Venezuelan refugees and migrants in Brazil. Available at: <https://www.acnur.org/portugues/2021/04/20/conheca-a-estrategia-que-ja-transformou-a-vida-de-50-mil-refugiados-e-migrantes-venezuelanos-no-brasil/>. Access in: 13/05/2022.
- UNITED NATIONS. ACNUR/UNHCR. *Temas específicos: interiorização*. Specific topics: interiorization. Available at: <https://www.acnur.org/portugues/temas-especificos/interiorizacao/>. Access in: 13/05/2022.
- UNITED NATIONS. IOM. *Integration of Venezuelan and Haitian Beneficiaries of IOM Cash-Based Intervention Programming in Brazil Key Findings from the Application of the IOM / IPL Migrant Integration Index Study Brief*. 2022. Available at: <https://brazil.iom.int/sites/g/files/tmzbd1496/files/documents/study-brief-integration-of-venezuelan-and-haitian.pdf>. Access in: 29/08/2022.
- UNITED NATIONS. IOM's Global Migration Data Analysis Centre (GMDAC). Global Migration Data Portal. *Migration Data and the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)*. Available at: <https://www.migrationdataportal.org/sdgs?node=0>. Access in 09/05/2022.
- UNITED NATIONS. IOM's Global Migration Data Analysis Centre (GMDAC). Global Migration Data Portal. *Migration Policies and Governance*. Last updated on 29 September 2021. Available at: <https://www.migrationdataportal.org/ar/themes/migrationspolitik-und-regierungsfuehrung>. Access in 09/05/2022.
- UNITED NATIONS. IOM's Global Migration Data Analysis Centre (GMDAC). Global Migration Data Portal. *Migration Governance Framework*. Available at: [https://www.iom.int/sites/g/files/tmzbd1486/files/about-iom/migof\\_brochure\\_a4\\_en.pdf](https://www.iom.int/sites/g/files/tmzbd1486/files/about-iom/migof_brochure_a4_en.pdf). Access in 09/05/2022.
- UNITED NATIONS. OIM. *The Sustainable Development Goals Report 2021*. New York. Available at <https://unstats.un.org/sdgs/report/2021/The-Sustainable-Development-Goals-Report-2021.pdf>. Access in: 12/05/2022.
- UNITED NATIONS. UN High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR), *Brasilia Declaration on the Protection of Refugees and Stateless Persons in the Americas*, 11 November 2010. Available at: <https://www.unhcr.org/protection/basic/4cdd3fac6/brasilia-declaration-protection-refugees-stateless-persons-americas-brasilia.html>. Access in: 13/05/2022.
- UNITED NATIONS. UN High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR). *Vulnerability Screening Tool. Identifying and addressing vulnerability: a tool for asylum and migration systems*. Available at: <https://www.unhcr.org/protection/detention/57fe30b14/unhcr-idc-vulnerability-screening-tool-identifying-addressing-vulnerability.html>. Access in: 20/05/2022.
- UNITED NATIONS. UNHCR. *Empoderando refugiadas*. Empowering refugees. Available at: <https://www.acnur.org/portugues/empoderando-refugiadas/>. Access in: 21/07/2022.
- UNITED NATIONS. UNHCR. *Limites e desafios à integração local de refugiadas, refugiados e pessoas migrantes da Venezuela interiorizadas durante a pandemia de Covid-19*. Limits and challenges to the local integration of refugees, refugees and migrants from Venezuela internalized during the Covid-19 Pandemic. 2021. Available at: <https://www.acnur.org/portugues/wp-content/uploads/2021/12/Sumario-Executivo-Limites-e-desafios-a-integracao-local-de-refugiadas-refugiados-e-pessoas-migrantes-da-Venezuela-interiorizadas-durante-a-pandemia-de-Covid-19-dez.2021.pdf>. Access in: 21/07/2022.
- WHO. World Health Organization. *Director-General's opening remarks at the media briefing on COVID19* on 11 March 2020. Available at: <https://www.who.int/director-general/speeches/detail/who-director-general-s-opening-remarks-at-the-media-briefing-on-covid-19---11-march-2020#:~:text=WHO%20has%20been%20assessing%20this,to%20use%20lightly%20or%20carelessly>. Access in: 07/07/2022.
- ZIZEK, S. *El coronavirus es un golpe al capitalismo a lo Kill Bill...* In P. Amadeo (Org), *Sopa de Wuhan: pensamiento contemporaneo en tiempos de pandemias* (p. 21-28). Buenos Aires: Aspo Editorial. 2020. P. 22.